

ROBINS KAPLAN LLP  
ATTORNEYS AT LAW  
LOS ANGELES

1 ROBINS KAPLAN LLP  
2 Roman M. Silberfeld, Bar No. 62783  
3 RSilberfeld@ robinskaplan.com  
4 Bernice Conn, Bar No. 161594  
5 BConn@ robinskaplan.com  
6 David Martinez, Bar No. 193183  
7 DMartinez@ robinskaplan.com  
8 Lucas A. Messenger, Bar No. 217645  
9 LMessenger@robinskaplan.com  
10 2049 Century Park East, Suite 3400  
11 Los Angeles, CA 90067-3208  
12 Telephone: 310-552-0130  
13 Facsimile: 310-229-5800

14 Attorneys for Plaintiffs

15 BEST BUY CO., INC.; BEST BUY PURCHASING LLC; BEST  
16 BUY ENTERPRISE SERVICES, INC.; BEST BUY STORES,  
17 L.P.; BESTBUY.COM, LLC

18 Additional Counsel Listed Below

19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
**NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**  
**SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION**

IN RE: CATHODE RAY TUBE (CRT)  
ANTITRUST LITIGATION

This Document Relates to:

*Best Buy Co. Inc. et al. v. Hitachi, Ltd. et al.*,  
No. 3:11-cv-05513-SC

*ViewSonic Corp. v. Chunghwa Picture Tubes,  
Ltd. et al.*, No. 3:14-cv-02510-SC

Master File No. 3:07-cv-05944-SC  
MDL No. 1917

The Honorable Samuel Conti

**DECLARATION OF LUCAS A.  
MESSENGER IN SUPPORT OF  
PLAINTIFFS' ADMINISTRATIVE  
MOTION TO FILE DOCUMENTS  
UNDER SEAL PURSUANT TO CIVIL  
LOCAL RULES 7-11 AND 79-5**

1 I, Lucas A. Messenger, declare and state as follows:

2 1. I am admitted to practice before this Court and am an associate with the law firm  
3 of Robins Kaplan LLP, counsel for Plaintiffs Best Buy Co., Inc., Best Buy Purchasing LLC, Best  
4 Buy Enterprise Services, Inc., Best Buy Stores, L.P., and Bestbuy.com, L.L.C. in the above-  
5 captioned action currently pending in the United States District Court for the Northern District of  
6 California. I make this declaration pursuant to L.R. 79-5 in support of PLAINTIFFS'  
7 ADMINISTRATIVE MOTION TO FILE DOCUMENTS UNDER SEAL PURSUANT TO  
8 CIVIL LOCAL RULES 7-11 AND 79-5. The facts set forth herein are true of my own personal  
9 knowledge, except where based on a review of the pleadings and records in this action, and, if  
10 called as a witness, I could and would competently testify thereto.

11 2. Through this Motion, Plaintiffs Best Buy<sup>1</sup> and ViewSonic Corporation  
12 (collectively, "Plaintiffs") seek permission to file under seal portions of their OPPOSITION TO  
13 CHUNGHWA PICTURE TUBES, LTD. AND CHUNGHWA PICTURE TUBES (MALAYSIA)  
14 SDN. BHD.'S MOTION IN LIMINE TO EXCLUDE OPINIONS REGARDING ACTUAL  
15 DAMAGES ATTRIBUTABLE TO THE CHUNGHWA DEFENDANTS (the "Opposition") on  
16 pages 1-6, 8-11, 13, and 15, as well as the entirety of Exhibits A-C and G-M to the Declaration of  
17 Lucas A. Messenger filed in support of the Opposition (respectively, the "Messenger  
18 Declaration" and "Messenger Exhibits"). Plaintiffs also request an order permitting them to file  
19 under seal portions of the Declaration of Alan S. Frankel filed in support of the Opposition (the  
20 "Frankel Declaration") on pages 1-4, as well as the entirety of Exhibits A-C (together with the  
21 Messenger Exhibits, the "Designated Exhibits").

22 Portions of the Opposition on pages 1-6, 8-13, and 15, the Frankel Declaration on pages 1-4, and  
23 the entirety of the Designated Exhibits contain excerpts from and/or statements derived from  
24 documents and testimony which have been designated "confidential" or "highly confidential"  
25 pursuant to the Stipulated Protective Order entered on June 18, 2008 by the Court *In re Cathode*  
26 *Ray Tube (CRT) Antitrust Litig.*, Case No. 07-5944-SC (MDL No. 1917), in the United States

27  
28 <sup>1</sup> "Best Buy" consists of Best Buy Co., Inc., Best Buy Purchasing LLC, Best Buy Enterprise  
Services, Inc., Best Buy Stores, L.P., and Bestbuy.com, L.L.C.

1 District Court for the Northern District of California, San Francisco Division (“CRT Antitrust  
 2 MDL”). (MDL Docket No. 306). The confidential/highly confidential designations were made  
 3 by certain parties in the CRT Antitrust MDL. To qualify as confidential or highly confidential  
 4 under the Stipulated Protective Order, the information must contain trade secrets or other  
 5 confidential research, development or commercial information or private or competitively  
 6 sensitive information. (Stipulated Protective Order ¶ 1.)

7       3. Paragraph 10 of the Stipulated Protective Order requires that a party may not file  
 8 any confidential material in the public record. Paragraphs 1 and 10 of the Stipulated Protective  
 9 Order further provide that any party seeking to file any confidential material under seal must  
 10 comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5.

11       4. Portions of the Opposition and the Frankel Declaration, as well as the entirety of  
 12 the Designated Exhibits, contain such confidential material and, pursuant to Local Rule 79-5(e),  
 13 Plaintiffs seek to submit the above material under seal in good faith in order to comply with the  
 14 Protective Order in the *CRT Antitrust MDL* and the applicable Local Rules. Specifically:

15       5. Pages 1-6, 8-11, 13, and 15 of the Opposition contain information that refers,  
 16 contains, and/or reflects excerpts of documents and testimony that have been designated as  
 17 “confidential” or “highly confidential” pursuant to the Stipulated Protective Order.

18       6. Pages 1-4 of the Frankel Declaration contain information that refers, contains,  
 19 and/or reflects excerpts of documents and testimony that have been designated as “confidential”  
 20 or “highly confidential” pursuant to the Stipulated Protective Order.

21       7. Exhibit A to the Messenger Declaration is a true and correct copy of excerpts from  
 22 the deposition of Alan S. Frankel taken on July 10, 2014, which is designated as “Highly  
 23 Confidential.”

24       8. Exhibit B to the Messenger Declaration is a true and correct copy of the expert  
 25 report submitted by Plaintiffs’ expert witness Dr. James T. McClave on April 15, 2014, which is  
 26 designated as “Highly Confidential” and contains and/or reflect information that has been  
 27 designated as “Confidential” or “Highly Confidential” pursuant to the Stipulated Protective  
 28 Order.

1       9.     Exhibit C to the Messenger Declaration is a true and correct copy of the rebuttal  
2 report submitted by Dr. McClave on September 26, 2014, which is designated as "Highly  
3 Confidential" and contains and/or reflect information that has been designated as "Confidential"  
4 or "Highly Confidential" pursuant to the Stipulated Protective Order.

5       10.    Exhibit G to the Messenger Declaration is a true and correct copy of the expert  
6 report submitted by Plaintiffs' expert Dr. Alan S. Frankel on April 15, 2014 on behalf of Best  
7 Buy (the "Best Buy Report"), which is designated as "Highly Confidential" and contains and/or  
8 reflects information that has been designated as "Confidential" or "Highly Confidential" pursuant  
9 to the Stipulated Protective Order.

10      11.    Exhibit H to the Messenger Declaration is a true and correct copy of the errata to  
11 the Best Buy Report submitted by Dr. Frankel on April 28, 2014, which is designated as "Highly  
12 Confidential" and contains and/or reflects information that has been designated as "Confidential"  
13 or "Highly Confidential" pursuant to the Stipulated Protective Order.

14      12.    Exhibit I to the Messenger Declaration is a true and correct copy of the expert  
15 report submitted by Plaintiffs' expert Dr. Frankel on June 6, 2014 on behalf of ViewSonic (the  
16 "ViewSonic Report"), which is designated as "Highly Confidential" and contains and/or reflects  
17 information that has been designated as "Confidential" or "Highly Confidential" pursuant to the  
18 Stipulated Protective Order.

19      13.    Exhibit J to the Messenger Declaration is a true and correct copy of the  
20 supplemental report submitted by Dr. Frankel on June 30, 2014 on behalf of Best Buy, which is  
21 designated as "Highly Confidential" and contains and/or reflects information that has been  
22 designated as "Confidential" or "Highly Confidential" pursuant to the Stipulated Protective  
23 Order.

24      14.    Exhibit K to the Messenger Declaration is a true and correct copy of the  
25 supplemental report submitted by Dr. Frankel on September 26, 2014, on behalf of ViewSonic,  
26 which is designated as "Highly Confidential" and contains and/or reflects information that has  
27 been designated as "Confidential" or "Highly Confidential" pursuant to the Stipulated Protective  
28 Order.

1       15.   Exhibit L to the Messenger Declaration is a true and correct copy of the rebuttal  
2 report submitted by Dr. Frankel on September 26, 2014 on behalf of Best Buy, which is  
3 designated as “Highly Confidential” and contains and/or reflects information that has been  
4 designated as “Confidential” or “Highly Confidential” pursuant to the Stipulated Protective  
5 Order.

6       16.   Exhibit M to the Messenger Declaration is a true and correct copy of the rebuttal  
7 report submitted by Dr. Frankel on September 26, 2014 on behalf of ViewSonic, which is  
8 designated as “Highly Confidential” and contains and/or reflects information that has been  
9 designated as “Confidential” or “Highly Confidential” pursuant to the Stipulated Protective  
10 Order.

11       17.   Exhibit A to the Frankel Declaration is a true and correct copy of a table prepared  
12 by Dr. Frankel on behalf of Best Buy reflecting damages attributable to Chunghwa for Best Buy’s  
13 indirect purchases of CRT Monitors , which contains and/or reflects information that has been  
14 designated as “Confidential” or “Highly Confidential” pursuant to the Stipulated Protective  
15 Order.

16       18.   Exhibit B to the Frankel Declaration is a true and correct copy of a table prepared  
17 by Dr. Frankel on behalf of Best Buy reflecting damages attributable to Chunghwa for Best Buy’s  
18 indirect purchases of CRT televisions, which contains and/or reflects information that has been  
19 designated as “Confidential” or “Highly Confidential” pursuant to the Stipulated Protective  
20 Order.

21       19.   Exhibit C to the Frankel Declaration is a true and correct copy of a table prepared  
22 by Dr. Frankel on behalf of ViewSonic reflecting damages attributable to Chunghwa for  
23 unallocated direct purchases, which contains and/or reflects information that has been designated  
24 as “Confidential” or “Highly Confidential” pursuant to the Stipulated Protective Order.

ROBINS KAPLAN LLP  
ATTORNEYS AT LAW  
LOS ANGELES

1 I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America and the  
2 State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

3 Executed this 27th day of February 2015 in Los Angeles, California.

4 /s/ *Lucas A. Messenger*

5 Lucas A. Messenger

10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

ROBINS KAPLAN LLP  
ATTORNEYS AT LAW  
LOS ANGELES